

# **Policy Evaluation of the Overall Effects of Welfare Reform on SSA Programs**

## ***Final Report***

Prepared for:

### **Social Security Administration**

Howard Iams, Task Manager  
Task Order No. 0440-98-33244  
Contract No. 0600-98-27331

Prepared by:

### **The Lewin Group, Inc.**

David C. Stapleton, Ph.D.  
Michael E. Fishman  
Gina A. Livermore, Ph.D.  
David Wittenburg, Ph.D.  
Adam Tucker  
Scott Scrivner

**April 23, 1999**

# **Policy Evaluation of the Overall Effects of Welfare Reform on SSA Programs**

## ***Final Report***

Prepared for:

### **Social Security Administration**

Howard Iams, Task Manager  
Task Order No. 0440-98-33244  
Contract No. 0600-98-27331

Prepared by:

### **The Lewin Group, Inc.**

David C. Stapleton, Ph.D.  
Michael E. Fishman  
Gina A. Livermore, Ph.D.  
David Wittenburg, Ph.D.  
Adam Tucker  
Scott Scrivner

**April 23, 1999**

---

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Work on this project was funded by the Social Security Administration under a contract to The Lewin Group. The project's Task Leader, David C. Stapleton directed the empirical analyses presented in Chapters 4 and 5, as well as the design of the evaluation options that rely on SSA administrative data and matched Census/SSA data. Co-Task Leader Michael E. Fishman, directed the review of welfare reform evaluations (Chapter 2), worked with Dr. Stapleton to plan the final report and craft the overall evaluation design, and directed the development of both the case study design option and the option that builds on welfare reform evaluations. Gina A. Livermore directed the state site visits (Chapter 3) and the writing of the report's introduction (Chapter 1), and managed the writing of the entire report. David Wittenburg drafted much of the welfare reform evaluation review (Chapter 2), directed the implementation of the SIPP/SSA data analysis and drafted the write up (Chapter 5); Scott Scrivner provided research assistance for both tasks. Adam Tucker directed the implementation of the administrative data analysis (Chapter 4), and Erica Chan performed the analysis. Stapleton, Fishman, Livermore, Wittenburg, Tucker and Scrivner all participated in at least one site visit and contributed to the site visit reports.

This document has benefited substantially from the technical oversight of Howard Iams, Ph.D., SSA's Task Manager. We are also appreciative of the assistance provided by SSA's Mary Barbour, Paul Davies, Howard Oberheu, Suzanne Payne, Kalman Rupp, Charles Scott, Steve Sandell, Dennis Vaughn, and Bernard Wixon.

This document also greatly benefited from a Technical Support Group (TSG), which reviewed the first major project deliverable (*Literature Review and Design Report*) for the project, as well as a draft of this report. The academic members of the TSG were: Joshua Angrist (Massachusetts Institute of Technology), Robert Hauser (University of Chicago), Robert Moffitt (Johns Hopkins University), Walter Oi (University of Rochester), and Marta Tienda (Princeton University). The government members were: David Baugh (Health Care Financing Administration), Michael Dubinsky (Administration for Children and Families), Robert Lott (Social Security Administration), Carol Peterson (General Accounting Office), Kalman Rupp, Steven Sandell, and Charles Scott.

The individuals who provided us information during our site visits are too numerous to mention here, but we are nonetheless grateful for their substantial help.

The opinions expressed and conclusions drawn in this report are the responsibility of the authors, and do not represent the official views of the Social Security Administration, other agencies, or The Lewin Group.

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>I. PURPOSE OF THE STUDY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>II. APPROACH TO DEVELOPING EVALUATION DESIGN OPTIONS.....</b>	<b>2</b>
A. LITERATURE REVIEW .....	2
B. REVIEW OF WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS.....	2
C. STATE SITE VISITS.....	3
D. PRELIMINARY ANALYSES OF THE PRE-REFORM PERIOD.....	3
<b>III. EVALUATION OPTIONS.....</b>	<b>5</b>
A. OBJECTIVES.....	5
B. SUMMARY OF OPTIONS .....	6
1. <i>Analysis of SSA Administrative Data</i> .....	6
2. <i>Analysis of Census/SSA Matched Data</i> .....	6
3. <i>State Welfare Reform Evaluations</i> .....	7
4. <i>State Case Studies</i> .....	8
5. <i>Other Data Sources</i> .....	9
6. <i>Summary</i> .....	10
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>I. PURPOSE OF THE STUDY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>II. PURPOSE OF THE REPORT.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>III. BACKGROUND ON SSA AND NON-SSA WELFARE REFORMS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
A. DIRECT EFFECTS OF SSA REFORMS.....	3
1. <i>SSI Changes for Children</i> .....	3
2. <i>Restriction on Benefits for Aliens</i> .....	5
3. <i>Change in Benefits for Drug Addicts and Alcoholics (DA&amp;A)</i> .....	5
B. INDIRECT EFFECTS OF NON-SSA REFORMS.....	5
1. <i>AFDC/TANF Changes</i> .....	5
2. <i>Food Stamp Changes</i> .....	7
3. <i>Multiple Program Changes/Other</i> .....	7
<b>IV. APPROACH TO DEVELOPING EVALUATION DESIGN OPTIONS.....</b>	<b>8</b>
A. LITERATURE REVIEW .....	8
B. REVIEW OF WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS.....	8
C. STATE SITE VISITS.....	9
D. ANALYSES OF THE PRE-REFORM PERIOD.....	9
<b>V. STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2: WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS.....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>I. INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>13</b>
A. OVERVIEW .....	13
B. CRITERIA FOR SELECTING EVALUATIONS.....	13
C. METHODOLOGY FOR REVIEWING WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS.....	14
D. WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS SELECTED.....	15
E. SUMMARY OF WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS.....	16
F. ORGANIZATION OF THE CHAPTER .....	16
<b>II. STATE WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS .....</b>	<b>16</b>
A. OVERVIEW OF ACF FUNDED PROJECTS.....	16
B. SUMMARY OF PROJECTS SELECTED FOR REVIEW .....	26
C. SUGGESTIONS.....	28
<b>III. WELFARE LEAVERS PROJECTS .....</b>	<b>29</b>
A. OVERVIEW OF WELFARE LEAVERS PROJECTS.....	29
B. SUGGESTIONS.....	29
<b>IV. MULTI-STATE/CITY EVALUATIONS .....</b>	<b>33</b>

---

A.	OVERVIEW .....	33
B.	SUGGESTIONS.....	34
<b>V.</b>	<b>IMMIGRANT WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS.....</b>	<b>35</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	35
B.	SUGGESTIONS.....	36
<b>VI.</b>	<b>SUMMARY OF SUGGESTIONS.....</b>	<b>36</b>
A.	SUMMARY OF PROJECTS.....	36
B.	SUMMARY OF PROJECTS OF CURRENT INTEREST TO SSA .....	36
C.	SUMMARY OF PROJECTS OF FUTURE INTEREST TO SSA .....	36
<b>CHAPTER 3: STATE SITE VISITS .....</b>		<b>39</b>
<b>I.</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>PURPOSE OF THE SITE VISITS .....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>METHODS .....</b>	<b>40</b>
A.	SELECTION OF STATES AND LOCALITIES.....	40
B.	SOURCES OF INFORMATION.....	41
<b>IV.</b>	<b>SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS.....</b>	<b>42</b>
A.	EFFECT OF STATE WELFARE REFORMS ON SSA PROGRAMS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES.....	42
1.	<i>Transitions to SSI.....</i>	42
2.	<i>Employment Services Available to Persons with Disabilities.....</i>	43
3.	<i>Welfare Safety Net for People with Disabilities .....</i>	43
4.	<i>SSA Program Administration.....</i>	44
B.	EFFECT OF SSA REFORMS.....	45
1.	<i>DA&amp;A Reforms .....</i>	45
2.	<i>Childhood Disability Reforms.....</i>	45
3.	<i>Non-Citizen Reforms.....</i>	45
C.	STATE WELFARE EVALUATION EFFORTS.....	46
D.	STATE DATA SOURCES.....	47
<b>CHAPTER 4: STATE-LEVEL ANALYSIS OF PRE-REFORM.....</b>		<b>53</b>
<b>ADULT SSI APPLICATION TRENDS.....</b>		<b>53</b>
<b>I.</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>53</b>
A.	PURPOSE .....	53
B.	APPLICATION DATA.....	54
C.	OVERVIEW .....	54
<b>II.</b>	<b>NATIONAL SSI APPLICATION TRENDS .....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>SSI APPLICATION TRENDS IN SELECTED STATES .....</b>	<b>63</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	63
B.	MIDWESTERN STATES .....	68
C.	NORTHEASTERN STATES.....	71
D.	PACIFIC COAST STATES.....	71
E.	SOUTHERN STATES .....	74
F.	SUMMARY .....	75
<b>IV.</b>	<b>POOLED TIME-SERIES ANALYSIS OF STATE SSI APPLICATIONS.....</b>	<b>75</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	75
B.	MODEL SPECIFICATION .....	76
C.	ESTIMATES.....	80
D.	ANALYSIS OF TRENDS IN STATES WITH EARLY REFORMS.....	84
E.	SUMMARY .....	86
<b>V.</b>	<b>CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>87</b>
<b>CHAPTER 5: ANALYSIS OF MATCHED SIPP/SSA DATA.....</b>		<b>91</b>
<b>I.</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>DESCRIPTION OF MATCHED DATA FILES .....</b>	<b>93</b>
A.	SIPP DATA DESCRIPTION.....	93
B.	MATCHED SSA RECORDS.....	94

---

C.	ADVANTAGES AND LIMITATIONS .....	96
D.	SAMPLE FOR DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSES.....	97
<b>III.</b>	<b>CHARACTERISTICS OF SSI AND AFDC RECIPIENTS, 1990 - 1993 .....</b>	<b>98</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	98
B.	ADULTS.....	98
1.	<i>SSI Recipient Characteristics .....</i>	99
2.	<i>Comparison of SSI and AFDC Recipients.....</i>	100
3.	<i>Transitions from AFDC to SSI.....</i>	100
C.	CHILDREN .....	105
1.	<i>Child SSI Recipients .....</i>	109
2.	<i>Comparison of AFDC Children to SSI Children.....</i>	109
3.	<i>Transitions from AFDC to SSI.....</i>	110
<b>IV.</b>	<b>CHARACTERISTICS OF POST-SIPP SSI APPLICANTS AND RECIPIENTS .....</b>	<b>110</b>
A.	POST-SIPP APPLICANTS.....	111
1.	<i>Adults .....</i>	111
2.	<i>Children .....</i>	112
B.	POST-SIPP SSI RECIPIENTS.....	112
1.	<i>Adults .....</i>	112
2.	<i>Children .....</i>	117
C.	COMPARISON OF POST-SIPP SSI RECIPIENTS TO SSI RECIPIENTS DURING THE FIRST SIPP INTERVIEW .....	117
<b>V.</b>	<b>ANALYSIS OF POTENTIAL TARGET AND COMPARISON GROUPS .....</b>	<b>119</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	119
B.	ADULTS.....	119
1.	<i>Women.....</i>	120
2.	<i>Fathers.....</i>	124
C.	CHILDREN .....	128
D.	SUMMARY OF FINDINGS CONCERNING TARGET AND COMPARISON GROUPS.....	130
<b>VI.</b>	<b>HAZARD ANALYSIS OF SSI APPLICATIONS AND ALLOWANCES, 1990-1996 .....</b>	<b>131</b>
A.	SPECIFICATIONS FOR YOUNG WOMEN AND YOUNG MEN .....	131
1.	<i>Econometric Model .....</i>	131
2.	<i>Sample.....</i>	133
3.	<i>Dependent Variables.....</i>	134
4.	<i>Explanatory Variables included in All Adult Models.....</i>	134
5.	<i>Other Explanatory Variables.....</i>	140
B.	RESULTS FROM ADULT SSI APPLICATION AND ALLOWANCE MODELS .....	141
1.	<i>Young Women .....</i>	141
2.	<i>Young Men .....</i>	154
C.	SPECIFICATIONS FOR CHILDREN .....	164
D.	RESULTS FROM CHILD SSI APPLICATION AND ALLOWANCE MODELS.....	166
1.	<i>Applications .....</i>	166
2.	<i>Allowances .....</i>	169
<b>VII.</b>	<b>CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>179</b>
A.	DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSES.....	179
B.	HAZARD ANALYSIS OF SSI APPLICATIONS AND ALLOWANCES .....	180
<b>CHAPTER 6: EVALUATION OPTIONS.....</b>		<b>183</b>
<b>I.</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>183</b>
A.	OBJECTIVES.....	183
B.	SUMMARY OF OPTIONS .....	184
1.	<i>Analysis of SSA Administrative Data .....</i>	184
2.	<i>Analysis of Census/SSA Matched Data .....</i>	184
3.	<i>State Welfare Reform Evaluations .....</i>	185
4.	<i>State Case Studies .....</i>	185
<b>II.</b>	<b>CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK.....</b>	<b>186</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	186
B.	COUNTERFACTUAL OUTCOME SERIES.....	186

---

C.	DYNAMIC RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN PRIMARY OUTCOME VARIABLES.....	189
D.	DI OUTCOMES .....	190
E.	TARGET AND COMPARISON GROUPS.....	190
F.	DELAYED IMPACTS ON APPLICATIONS AND ALLOWANCES.....	192
G.	CHANGE IN TIMING OF ALLOWANCES.....	193
<b>III.</b>	<b>ANALYSIS OF SSA ADMINISTRATIVE DATA.....</b>	<b>193</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	193
B.	DIFFERENCE-IN-DIFFERENCES (DID) ANALYSES .....	194
1.	<i>Methodology .....</i>	194
2.	<i>DID Estimators for the Impacts of TANF .....</i>	202
3.	<i>DID Estimators for the Combined Impacts of TANF and DA&amp;A Reforms.....</i>	206
4.	<i>DID Estimators for the Combined Impacts of TANF and SSI Child Reforms .....</i>	207
5.	<i>Analysis of Non-Citizen Reforms .....</i>	207
C.	POOLED TIME-SERIES ANALYSIS OF DID ESTIMATES.....	211
1.	<i>Objectives .....</i>	211
2.	<i>Technical Specification.....</i>	212
3.	<i>Interpretation.....</i>	215
<b>IV.</b>	<b>ANALYSIS OF MATCHED CENSUS/SSA DATA.....</b>	<b>215</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	215
B.	THE IMPACTS OF TANF .....	216
1.	<i>Objectives .....</i>	216
2.	<i>Data.....</i>	217
3.	<i>Econometric Model .....</i>	218
4.	<i>Simulations .....</i>	223
C.	THE COMBINED IMPACTS OF ALL REFORMS ON CASELOADS AND BENEFITS.....	224
1.	<i>Objectives .....</i>	224
2.	<i>Data.....</i>	225
3.	<i>Methodology .....</i>	225
4.	<i>Use of the Models to Analyze the Impacts of Reforms.....</i>	227
5.	<i>Adjustments for Changes in the Economy .....</i>	229
6.	<i>Use of Matched CPS/SSA Data.....</i>	229
7.	<i>Strengths and Limitations.....</i>	229
D.	VALIDATING AND IMPROVING THE DID ANALYSIS OF ADMINISTRATIVE DATA.....	230
<b>V.</b>	<b>EVALUATING THE EFFECTS OF TANF USING EXISTING STATE WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS .....</b>	<b>231</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	231
B.	SPECIFIC OPPORTUNITIES.....	231
<b>VI.</b>	<b>STATE CASE STUDIES .....</b>	<b>235</b>
A.	OVERVIEW .....	235
B.	DATA SOURCES .....	236
C.	DID ESTIMATES .....	241
<b>VII.</b>	<b>OTHER DATA SOURCES .....</b>	<b>243</b>
A.	INFORMATION ON STATE TANF PROGRAMS.....	243
B.	OTHER ADMINISTRATIVE DATA SOURCES.....	244
C.	OTHER SURVEY DATA SOURCES .....	245
<b>REFERENCES.....</b>		<b>249</b>

---

## **APPENDICES**

- A: HISTORY OF RELEVANT PROGRAM LEGISLATION, REGULATIONS, AND COURT DECISIONS
- B: SUMMARY OF SPECIFIC WELFARE REFORM EVALUATIONS
- C: STATE SITE VISIT REPORTS
- D: AGGREGATE DATA ANALYSIS OF THE PRE-REFORM PERIOD
- E: ANALYSIS OF SIPP/SSA MATCHED DATA FOR THE PRE-REFORM PERIOD
- F: ACCOUNTING RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN KEY OUTCOME VARIABLES

---

**THIS PAGE BLANK**